Secretary, Town Planning Board 15/F, North Point Government Offices 333 Java Road, North Point, Hong Kong (E-mail: tpbpd@pland.gov.hk)

Dear Sir/Madam,

By email only

24 June 2015

香港觀鳥會
THE
HONG
KONG
BIRD
WATCHING
SOCIETY

Since 1957 成立

Incorporated with limited liability



Representation for Draft Yung Shue O Outline Zoning Plan (S/NE-YSO/1)

The Hong Kong Bird Watching Society (HKBWS) would like to make a representation and raise our comments on the Draft Yung Shue O Outline Zoning Plan (S/NE-YSO/1).

1. Planning intention of the draft Outline Zoning Plan (OZP)

The planning intention of the draft OZP, which is to "protect its high conservation and landscape value which complements the overall naturalness and the landscape beauty of the surrounding Sai Kung West Country Park"¹, has been well-noted. The provision of conservation zonings should be applied to the plan to reflect this planning intention. Any development recommendations or decisions on zonings in the draft Plan that deviates from this planning intention should require specific justifications from the Town Planning Board and relevant Government departments (e.g., Planning Department, Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation Department, Drainage Services Department, Transport Department, Water Services Department, etc.) for the recommendation/ endorsement of a conflicting zoning in an area of high conservation and landscape value.

2. Ecological importance of Yung Shue O

Yung Shue O comprises of secondary woodland, freshwater marshes, fallow agriculture land, mangroves and natural streams. These habitats are ecologically connected to the Sai Kung West Country Park and supports wide range of flora and fauna of conservation concern.

Up till 2014, HKBWS has recorded 147 species of birds in Yung Shue O², which accounts for almost 30% of total number of bird species recorded in Hong Kong³;

地址: 香港九龍荔枝角青山道532號偉基大廈7樓C室 Address: 7C, V Ga Building, 532 Castle Peak Road, Lai Chi Kok, Kowloon, Hong Kong 電話 Tel.No.: 2377 4387 傳真 Fax.No.: 2314 3687

電郵 E-mail.: hkbws@hkbws.org.hk

¹ Section 8.1 of Explanatory Statement of the draft Chek Keng Outline Zoning Plan.

² The bird records are compiled from *The Avifauna of Hong Kong* (Carey *et al.*, 2001), *Hong Kong Bird Report 1999-2013*, and data reported on the HKBWS Forum.

³ Total bird species in Hong Kong is 531.

among them, 44 species are of conservation concern (Appendix 1). A diverse group of birds have been found in the Plan Area, including waterbirds (e.g., egrets, herons, terns, shorebirds, kingfishers and cormorants), woodland birds (e.g., flycatchers, flowerpeckers and babblers), open country birds (e.g., buntings), nocturnal birds (e.g., owls and nightjars) and raptor species (e.g., eagles and hawks). The presence of such a wide range of bird species indicates the Plan Area is with undisturbed diverse natural habitats which are worthy of protection.

Yung Shue O is frequented by various raptors of conservation concern, including Crested Serpent Eagle (*Spilornis cheela*), Crested Goshawk (*Accipiter trivirgatus*), White-bellied Sea Eagle (*Haliaeetus leucogaster*), Brown Fish Owl (*Ketupa zeylonensis*) and Collared Scops Owl (*Otus bakkamoena*), which all are under Class II protection in China⁴.

Brown Fish Owl is a scarce resident in Hong Kong⁵. It is considered to be of Regional Concern⁶ and is listed under Class II protection in the People's Republic of China List of Wild Animals⁴. This species feeds in undisturbed, unpolluted lowland streams and tidal creeks⁵. The woodlands in Yung Shue O provide suitable roosting habitats for the Brown Fish Owls while the unpolluted natural streams and their riparian vegetation are suitable foraging grounds and perches for this species. The occurrence of this species and other raptor species, which are top predators in the food web, indicates that the terrestrial, river and marine ecosystem is in healthy condition with low level of disturbance.

Yellow-breasted Bunting (*Emberiza aureola*) is another species of conservation concern recorded in Yung Shue O, which is listed as Globally Endangered⁷ and of Regional Concern by Fellowes *et al.* (2002). A new study published in the journal Conservation Biology indicates that the population of Yellow-breasted Bunting, which was once one of the most abundant birds in Europe and Asia, has dropped by 90% and its range has reduced by 5000 km in the past 30 years⁸. The bird is

⁴ List of Wild Animals under State Protection (promulgated by State Forestry Administration and Ministry of Agriculture on 14 January, 1989).

⁵ Carey, G.J., Chalmers, M.L., Diskin, D.A., Kennerley, P.R., Leader, P.J., Leven, M.R., Lewthwaite, R.W., Melville, D.S., Turnbull, M. and Young, L. (2001). *The Avifauna of Hong Kong*. Hong Kong Bird Watching Society.

⁶ Fellowes, J.R., Lau, M.W.N., Dudgeon, D., Reels, G.T., Ades, G.W.J., Carey, G.J., Chan, B.P.L., Kendrick, R.C., Lee, K.S., Leven, M.R., Wilson, K.D.P. and Yu, Y.T. (2002). Wild animals to watch: Terrestrial and freshwater fauna of conservation concern in Hong Kong. *Memoirs of the Hong Kong Natural History Society* No. 25, 123-160.

⁷ http://www.iucnredlist.org/details/22720966/0

⁸ Kamp, J., Oppel, S., Ananin, A. A., Durnev, Y. A., Gashev, S. N., Hölzel, N., Mishchenko, A. L., Pessa, J.,

restricted to open country, including wet and dry farmland, grassland in abandoned agricultural land and reed bed margins⁵. This globally endangered species, together with other buntings, were found to find cover in the mangroves and the grassland in the fallow fields of Yung Shue O.

Besides avifauna, the Plan Area also supports other fauna and flora of conservation concern. Yung Shue O is one of the 12 Priority Sites for Enhanced Conservation under the New Nature Conservation Policy⁹ and 91 species of butterflies (which accounts for almost 40% of the total number of butterfly species in Hong Kong¹⁰) were recorded in the area at the time of assessment. Yung Shue O is also identified as a butterfly hotspot by Green Power¹¹. Very Rare butterfly species recorded include Commander (*Moduza procris*) and Broadtail Royal (*Creon cleobis*). From the information provided by Kadoorie Farm and Botanic Garden, a rare orchid species *Liparis ferruginea* was found in the wet grassland in Yung Shue O¹². Also, there is an Ecologically Important Stream, which is well-recognized by the Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation Department, flowing through Yung Shue O¹³.

3. Our Concerns and Recommendations

habitats in Yung Shue O, including the secondary woodlands, freshwater marshes (permanent or seasonal), fallow agriculture lands, mangroves and natural streams, are of significant conservation importance and should be well-protected. Currently there are no plans to provide sewerage for areas outside the existing village clusters¹⁴, therefore any small house development in the area outside the "Village Type Development" zone would likely lead to water pollution caused by the soakaway system of the small houses. In order to prevent developments in these sensitive habitats and to protect the water quality and ecology of the entire river and wetland system in Yung Shue O, HKBWS considers that an "Ecosystem

Smirenski, S. M., Strelnikov, E. G., Timonen, S., Wolanska, K. and Chan, S. (2015). Global population collapse in a superabundant migratory bird and illegal trapping in China. *Conservation Biology*. doi: 10.1111/cobi.12537

https://www.afcd.gov.hk/english/publications/publications_con/files/IssueNo21.pdf

⁹ http://www.afcd.gov.hk/english/conservation/con_nncp/con_nncp_list/con_nncp_list.html

¹⁰ The active checklist of Hong Kong butterflies by Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation Department has 236 species. Data retrieved from

¹¹ http://www.greenpower.org.hk/html/eng/job butterfly 10.shtml

¹² Plan 8 and Annex X of TPB Paper No. 9868

https://www.afcd.gov.hk/english/conservation/con_wet/streams_rivers_hk/Con_NSR/files/33_ Yung_Shue_O.pdf

¹⁴ Section 9.1.6 of the Explanatory Statement of the draft Yung Shue O OZP

Approach", which is the primary framework for action under the Convention on Biological Diversity¹⁵, should be adopted; that is to rezone the current "Green Belt" zoning into "Green Belt (1)"/"Conservation Area" zoning, which alleviates the development pressure from small houses.

Lastly, the introduction of planning control alone could not fully protect the sites from activities such as unauthorized tree felling and vegetation removal. In order to fully protect the ecological and landscape values of the site, as well as the overall value of the surrounding Sai Kung West Country Park, the Authority should consider including Yung Shue O into the Sai Kung West Country Park following detailed assessments and public consultation. HKBWS believes that Yung Shue O and surrounding areas are qualified for such purpose given its significant landscape and ecological value.

Thank you for your kind attention and we hope that the Town Planning Board would take our comments into consideration.

Yours faithfully,

Woo Ming Chuan

Conservation Officer

Hong Kong Bird Watching Society

CC.

Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation Department

Conservancy Association

Designing Hong Kong

Green Power

Kadoorie Farm and Botanic Garden

WWF - Hong Kong

4

¹⁵ https://www.cbd.int/ecosystem/

No.	Common Name ⁽¹⁾	Scientific Name	Level of Concern ⁽⁴⁾	Protection Status in China ⁽⁵⁾	China Red Data Book ⁽⁶⁾	IUCN Red List (Version 2015.2) ⁽⁷⁾
	Chinese Francolin	Francolinus pintadeanus	-	-	-	-
2	Black-crowned Night Heron (9)	Nycticorax nycticorax	(LC)	-	-	-
3	Striated Heron ⁽⁹⁾	Butorides striatus	(LC)	-	-	-
	Chinese Pond Heron ⁽⁹⁾	Ardeola bacchus	PRC (RC)	-	-	-
	Eastern Cattle Egret ⁽⁹⁾ Grey Heron ⁽⁹⁾	Bubulcus coromandus Ardea cinerea	(LC) PRC	-	-	-
7	Great Egret ⁽⁹⁾	Ardea modesta	PRC (RC)	-	-	-
8	Little Egret ⁽⁹⁾	Egretta garzetta	PRC (RC)	_	_	-
9	Great Cormorant ⁽⁹⁾	Phalacrocorax carbo	PRC	-	-	-
10	Western Osprey ⁽⁸⁾⁽⁹⁾	Pandion haliaetus	RC	-	Rare	-
11	Crested Serpent Eagle ⁽⁸⁾	Spilornis cheela	(LC)	Class II	Vulnerable	-
12	Bonelli's Eagle ⁽⁸⁾⁽⁹⁾	Aquila fasciata	(RC)	Class II	Rare	-
13	Crested Goshawk ⁽⁸⁾	Accipiter trivirgatus	-	Class II	Rare	-
14	Chinese Sparrowhawk ⁽⁸⁾	Accipiter soloensis	-	Class II	-	-
15	Besra ⁽⁸⁾	Accipiter virgatus		Class II	-	-
16	Black Kite ⁽⁸⁾⁽⁹⁾	Milvus migrans	(RC)	Class II	-	-
	White-bellied Sea Eagle ⁽⁸⁾⁽⁹⁾	Haliaeetus leucogaster	(RC)	Class II	-	-
18	Slaty-legged Crake Slaty-breasted Rail ⁽⁹⁾	Rallina eurizonoides Gallirallus striatus	- DC	-	- Dave	-
19	White-breasted Waterhen (9)		RC -	-	Rare -	-
	Watercock ⁽⁹⁾	Amaurornis phoenicurus Gallicrex cinerea				
	Eurasian Woodcock	Scolopax rusticola	RC -	-	-	-
23	Whimbrel ⁽⁹⁾	Numenius phaeopus	LC	-	-	-
24	Common Greenshank ⁽⁹⁾	Tringa nebularia	RC	-	-	-
	Grey-tailed Tattler ⁽⁹⁾	Tringa hebuana Tringa brevipes	LC	-	-	Near Threatened
	Common Sandpiper ⁽⁹⁾	Actitis hypoleucos	-	-	-	-
	Red-necked Phalarope (9)	Phalaropus lobatus	-	-	-	-
	Black-headed Gull ⁽⁹⁾	Chroicocephalus ridibundus	PRC	-	-	-
29	Bridled Tern	Onychoprion anaethetus	-	-	-	-
30	Black-naped Tern ⁽⁹⁾	Sterna sumatrana	(LC)	-	-	-
31	Common Tern ⁽⁹⁾	Sterna hirundo	-	-	-	-
32	White-winged Tern ⁽⁹⁾	Chlidonias leucopterus	-	-	-	-
33	Oriental Turtle Dove	Streptopelia orientalis	-	-	-	-
	Red Turtle Dove	Streptopelia tranquebarica	-	-	-	-
	Spotted Dove	Streptopelia chinensis	-	-	-	-
	Common Emerald Dove	Chalcophaps indica	-	-	Vulnerable	-
	Greater Coucal	Centropus sinensis	-	Class II	Vulnerable	-
	Lesser Coucal	Centropus bengalensis	-	Class II	Vulnerable	-
	Chestnut-winged Cuckoo	Clamator coromandus	-	-	-	-
	Asian Koel	Eudynamys scolopacea	-	-	-	-
	Plaintive Cuckoo	Cacomantis merulinus	-	-	-	-
	Large Hawk Cuckoo Hodgson's Hawk Cuckoo	Hierococcyx sparverioides Hierococcyx nisicolor	-	-	-	-
	Indian Cuckoo	Cuculus micropterus	-		-	-
	Collared Scops Owl ⁽⁸⁾	Otus lettia	-	Class II	-	-
46	Brown Fish Owl ⁽⁸⁾	Ketupa zeylonensis	RC	Class II	_	_
47	Asian Barred Owlet ⁽⁸⁾	Glaucidium cuculoides	-	Class II	_	-
48	Grey Nightjar	Caprimulgus jotaka	LC	-	-	-
	Savanna Nightjar	Caprimulgus affinis	-	-	-	-
50	Pacific Swift	Apus pacificus	(LC)	-	-	-
51	Oriental Dollarbird	Eurystomus orientalis	-	-	-	-
52	Black-capped Kingfisher (9)	Halcyon pileata	(LC)	-	-	-
53	Common Kingfisher ⁽⁹⁾	Alcedo atthis	-	-	-	-
	Great Barbet	Megalaima virens	-	-	-	-
	Eurasian Wryneck	Jynx torquilla	-	-	-	-
56	Amur Falcon	Falco amurensis		Class II	- D	-
57	Peregrine Falcon ⁽⁸⁾⁽⁹⁾	Falco peregrinus	(LC)	Class II	Rare	-
	Black-winged Cuckoo-shrike	Coracina melaschistos Pericrocotus speciosus	-	-	-	-
	Scarlet Minivet Brown Shrike	Lanius cristatus	-	-	-	-
	Long-tailed Shrike	Lanius cristatus Lanius schach	-	-	-	-
	Ashy Drongo	Dicrurus leucophaeus	LC	-	-	-
	Hair-crested Drongo	Dicrurus hottentottus	-	-	-	-
	Black-naped Monarch	Hypothymis azurea	-	-	-	-
	Asian Paradise-Flycatcher	Terpsiphone paradisi	LC	-	-	-
	Red-billed Blue Magpie	Urocissa erythrorhyncha	-	-	-	-
	Grey Treepie	Dendrocitta formosae	LC	-	-	-
	Eurasian Magpie	Pica pica	-	-	-	-
	Collared Crow	Corvus torquatus	LC	-	-	Near Threatened
70	Large-billed Crow	Corvus macrorhynchos	-	-	-	-
	Grey-headed Canary-flycatcher	Culicicapa ceylonensis	-	-	-	-
72	Cinereous Tit	Parus cinereus	-	-	-	-
	Red-whiskered Bulbul	Pycnonotus jocosus	-	-	-	-
	Chinese Bulbul	Pycnonotus sinensis	-	-	-	-
	Mountain Bulbul	Ixos mcclellandii	-	-	-	-
	Chestnut Bulbul	Hemixos castanonotus	-	-	-	-
	Barn Swallow	Hirundo rustica	-	-	-	-
	Pygmy Wren-babbler	Pnoepyga pusilla	-	-	-	-
	Mountain Tailorbird	Phyllergates cucullatus	-	-	-	-
80	Japanese Bush Warbler	Horornis diphone	-	-	-	-
	Manchurian Bush Warbler	Horornis borealis	_	-	-	_

Appendix 1 - Birdlist of Yung Shue O

No.	Common Name ⁽¹⁾	Scientific Name	Level of Concern ⁽⁴⁾	Protection Status in China ⁽⁵⁾	China Red Data Book ⁽⁶⁾	IUCN Red List (Version 2015.2) ⁽⁷⁾
82	Brown-flanked Bush Warbler	Horornis fortipes	-	-	-	-
	Asian Stubtail	Urosphena squameiceps	-	-	-	-
	Dusky Warbler	Phylloscopus fuscatus	-	-	-	-
	Pallas's Leaf Warbler	Phylloscopus proregulus	-	-	-	-
	Yellow-browed Warbler	Phylloscopus inornatus	-	-	-	-
	Arctic Warbler Two-barred Warbler	Phylloscopus borealis Phylloscopus plumbeitarsus	-	-	-	-
	Pale-legged Leaf Warbler	Phylloscopus tenellipes	-	-		-
	Goodson's Leaf Warbler	Phylloscopus goodsoni	LC	-	_	-
	Oriental Reed Warbler	Acrocephalus orientalis	-	-	-	-
	Black-browed Reed Warbler	Acrocephalus bistrigiceps	-	-	-	-
93	Lanceolated Warbler	Locustella lanceolata	-	-	-	-
94	Pallas's Grasshopper Warbler	Locustella certhiola	LC	-	-	-
95	Zitting Cisticola	Cisticola juncidis	LC	-	-	-
	Yellow-bellied Prinia	Prinia flaviventris	-	-	-	-
_	Plain Prinia	Prinia inornata	-	-	-	-
	Common Tailorbird	Orthotomus sutorius	-	-	-	-
	Streak-breasted Scimitar Babbler	Pomatorhinus ruficollis	-	-	-	-
	Rufous-capped Babbler	Stachyris ruficeps	LC	-	-	-
_	Chinese Hwamei	Garrulax canorus	-	-	-	-
	Masked Laughingthrush	Garrulax perspicillatus	-	-	-	-
	Greater Necklaced Laughingthrush	Garrulax pectoralis	-	-	-	-
	Black-throated Laughingthrush Chesnut-collared Yuhina	Garrulax chinensis Yuhina castaniceps	(LC)	-	-	-
	Japanese White-eve	Zosterops japonicus	(LC)	-	-	-
	Velvet-fronted Nuthatch	Sitta frontalis	-	-	_	-
	Crested Myna	Acridotheres cristatellus	-	-	-	-
	Red-billed Starling ⁽⁹⁾	Spodiopsar sericeus	RC	_	_	_
	Siberian Thrush	Geokichla sibirica	-	-	_	-
	White's Thrush	Zoothera aurea	-	-	-	-
	Grey-backed Thrush	Turdus hortulorum	-	-	-	-
	Japanese Thrush	Turdus cardis	-	-	-	-
114	Common Blackbird	Turdus merula	-	-	-	-
115	Eyebrowed Thrush	Turdus obscurus	-	-	-	-
	Pale Thrush	Turdus pallidus	-	-	-	-
	Brown-headed Thrush	Turdus chrysolaus	LC	-	-	-
	Oriental Magpie Robin	Copsychus saularis	-	-	-	-
	Grey-streaked Flycatcher	Muscicapa griseisticta	-	-	-	-
	Dark-sided Flycatcher	Muscicapa sibirica	-	-	-	-
	Asian Brown Flycatcher	Muscicapa latirostris	-	-	-	-
	Hainan Blue Flycatcher Small Niltava	Cyornis hainanus Niltava macgrigoriae	-	-	-	-
	Lesser Shortwing	Brachypteryx leucophris	LC	-	-	-
	Siberian Blue Robin	Luscinia cyane	LC	-	-	-
	Rufous-tailed Robin	Luscinia sibilans	-	-	_	-
	Bluethroat	Luscinia svecica	LC	-	-	-
	Siberian Rubythroat	Luscinia calliope	-	-	-	-
129	Red-flanked Bluetail	Tarsiger cyanurus	-	-	-	-
130	Blue Whistling Thrush	Myophonus caeruleus	-	-	-	-
131	Yellow-rumped Flycatcher	Ficedula zanthopygia	-	-	-	-
	Daurian Redstart	Phoenicurus auroreus	-	-	-	-
	Stejneger's Stonechat	Saxicola stejnegeri	-	-	-	-
	Grey Bush Chat	Saxicola ferreus	LC	-	-	-
	Scarlet-backed Flowerpecker	Dicaeum cruentatum	-	-	-	-
	Fork-tailed Sunbird	Aethopyga christinae	-	-	-	-
	Eurasian Tree Sparrow	Passer montanus	-	-	-	-
	Scaly-breasted Munia	Lonchura punctulata	-	-	-	-
	Forest Wagtail Grey Wagtail	Dendronanthus indicus Motacilla cinerea	-	-	-	-
	Olive-backed Pipit	Anthus hodgsoni	-	-	-	-
	Tristram's Bunting	Emberiza tristrami	-	-	-	-
	Chestnut-eared Bunting	Emberiza fucata	LC	-	<u>-</u>	-
	Little Bunting	Emberiza pusilla	-	-	-	-
	Yellow-breasted Bunting	Emberiza aureola	RC	-	-	Endangered
	Chestnut Bunting	Emberiza rutila	-	-	-	-
	Black-faced Bunting	Emberiza spodocephala	-	-	-	-

Note

- (1) All wild birds are Protected under Wild Animal Protection Ordinance (Cap. 170)
- (4) Fellowes *et al* . (2002): GC=Global Concern; LC=Local Concern; RC=Regional Concern; PRC=Potential Regional Concern; PGC: Potential Global Concern. Letters in parentheses indicate that the assessment is on the basis of restrictedness in nesting and/or roosting sites rather than in general occurrence.
- (5) List of Wild Animals Under State Protection (promulgated by State Forestry Administration and Ministry of Agriculture on 14 January, 1989).
- [國家重點保護野生動物名錄(1989年1月14日林業局及農業部發佈施行)]
- (6) Zheng, G. M. and Wang, Q. S. (1998).
- (7) IUCN (2015). IUCN Red List of Threatened Species. Version 2015.2
- (8) Protected under Protection of Endangered Species of Animals and Plants Ordinance (Cap. 586)
- (9) Wetland-dependent species (including wetland-dependent species and waterbirds)